FRANCE

2021

TOBACCO INDUSTRY INTERFERENCE INDEX

Introduction

Since the 1970s, France has adopted different tobacco control legislations. The country ratified the WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (WHO FCTC) treaty in 2004. In 2008, France adopted the WHO FCTC Article 5.3 Guidelines¹ which provides specific measures to protect public policies from tobacco industry interference. In 2016, during the last health legislation it has promulgated several tobacco control provisions. Some of them particularly concern the protection of public policies from the interference of the tobacco industry. The tobacco industry and its allies challenged numerous provisions of the legislation but did not challenge the ones concerning more transparency to avoid bad publicity especially following the revelation to the public about their practices with some politicians and civil servants.²

Over these past years, France defined ambitious objectives concerning tobacco control with the aim to reach a tobacco-free generation by 2032. This ambition has been recently reminded/recalled when the last cancer plan was launched. In this perspective, different measures were adopted and implemented especially a strong policy regarding taxation despite the opposition of the tobacco industry and its allies. However, some measures which need to be renewed and pursued have been indefinitely postponed. This may be attributed to the current pandemic situation which focuses all efforts by public authorities but at the same time a growing activity has been developed by the tobacco industry.

This report assesses how the government has responded to interference from the tobacco industry and what action the government has in place to protect itself. The questionnaire used in this report is developed by the Southeast Asia Tobacco Control Alliance (SEATCA) based on the specific recommendations from Article 5.3 guidelines.³ This report focuses on instances of interference and government responses from January 2020 to March 2021. The lower the score, the better the compliance of Article 5.3 guidelines. Overall, the government has performed several efforts in implementing Article 5.3 guidelines but there are still measures to adopt and besides this a strong necessity to check and control the conformity of disclosures by the tobacco industry and to monitor about possible circumvents of the legislation.

As this is the third report of its kind for France, the purpose is to evaluate if there have been some changes during that period and what kind of progress can be seen over the years. Overall, the score for France has increased, from 27 to 33 points. This deterioration is due to an adaptation of the tobacco industry to rules and their approach to circumvent these rules and it is also due to no change to strengthen current provisions in enlarging them to other key stakeholders such as MPs or any civil servant or collaborators in all public activities. There is therefore room for improvement and recommendations are made in areas that need to be strengthened.

¹ Framework Convention on Tobacco Control. Guidelines for implementation of FCTC Article 5.3, Geneva 2008, [decision FCTC/COP3(7)] http://www.who.int/fctc/treaty instruments/Guidelines Article 5 3 English.pdf?ua=1

² https://www.parismatch.com/Actu/Politique/L-emission-qui-a-secoue-les-politiques-518248 https://www.dailymotion.com/video/x3jfu4a

³ Assunta, M. Dorotheo, E. U.. SEATCA Tobacco Industry Interference Index: a tool for measuring implementation of WHO Framework Convention on Tobacco Control Article 5.3. April 2015 http://tobaccocontrol.bmj.com/content/early/2015/04/23/tobaccocontrol-2014-051934

Summary Findings

I. INDUSTRY PARTICIPATION IN POLICY DEVELOPMENT

In 2020 and 2021, there was no general election and the majority at the Parliament has remained the same. At the level of the Government a new Prime Minister was designated but the health minister did not change.

During the period 2020 and 2021 the influence from the tobacco industry and its main ally, the National Federation for Tobacco Retailers (NFTR, Confédération des buralistes de France) was still blocked. This is primarily because of the political will at the level of the health minister, the Prime Minister and the French president as well as having a clear fiscal strategy with an objective. The Minister, in charge of budget and of the tobacco retailers, continues to have a strong relationship with NFTR. The budget minister is also in charge of the key file of the tracking and tracing system to fight against the illicit trade of tobacco products. Despite the fact this protocol belongs to the Health Ministry, its involvement is limited and may be insufficient to prevent the interference of the tobacco industry.

Thanks to a co-decision at the level of Budget Ministry and Health Ministry about tobacco taxation, the interference of the tobacco industry to influence that policy failed last year and the overall the cooperation between public agencies and Health and Customs has improved. However, the tobacco industry tried to circumvent this common policy through different initiatives especially at the level of the Parliament or through the use of third parties. It is therefore necessary to develop further initiatives and provisions in order to protect the setting and implementation of public policies especially public health policies.

2. INDUSTRY CSR ACTIVITIES

Since 2016 and the adoption of new tobacco control provisions, the previous advertising, promotion, sponsoring ban has been extended to philanthropies activities and therefore include all CSR activities. The legislation is very comprehensive and prohibits these activities carried out by the tobacco industry and also by third parties if they directly or indirectly may promote tobacco, tobacco products. However, the tobacco industry tries to use the notion of harm reduction or new social challenges such as gender equality to promote a new and good image of its activities.

Beside this, as mentioned in previous reports this provision does not concern tobacco retailers and their professional organizations which continue to develop CSR activities, especially in the framework of the COVID-19 pandemic.

3. BENEFITS TO THE INDUSTRY

In comparison with last year's report, we have a significant improvement in the quantity of French tobacco products now allowed to be brough back from other EU member State. Now this quantity has been reduced four times in comparison with previous years.

However, some other benefits continue to be granted to the tobacco industry and its allies such as a favorable taxation for new tobacco products: heat not burn tobacco and also financial support to tobacco retailers. Like in previous years, the French government continues to financially support the tobacco retailers despite the fact that their revenues have constantly increased for years. The government concluded a new contract which has been enforced during the period 2020-2021. This contract is to help tobacco retailers diversify their activities but in the past many financial supports were already granted to the profession for such a purpose. While other activities which do not cause health damages and other social costs are not supported in such a manner.

4. UNNECESSARY INTERACTION

There was no special change since the last report and the analysis remains valid. The main problematic relationship between the government and the tobacco lobby refer to their interaction with tobacco retailers and their representatives. Such situation is actually problematic because there are still links and financial relationships between the tobacco industry and the tobacco retailers / their representatives. The tobacco industry uses this organization as a third party to protect and develop its interests. They particularly use them in their harm reduction strategy to change the legal framework.

Another key problem is many stakeholders do not know about the FCTC, particularly Article 5.3 guidelines. In their activities, they consider to a certain extent that they have to work with representatives from the tobacco industry like with other industries.

5. TRANSPARENCY

Different provisions were adopted in the last years in France in order to improve transparency generally in the public activities and public life. These provisions apply to public stakeholders and representatives of private interest. The concern is not solely focused on the tobacco industry but in general to improve transparency including tobacco stakeholders. There are also specific provisions regarding the tobacco industry and particularly the expenditures spent for lobbying activities. The main problem regarding this last provision concerns the control about the sincerity of budgets mentioned by the tobacco industry in their disclosure.

Like mentioned in previous reports, standards and transparency concerning the framework of interaction when it is necessary between public stakeholders and the tobacco industry in a large definition (including the tobacco retailers and their representatives) are still insufficient about topics at the agenda, minutes etc.

6. CONFLICT OF INTEREST

The disclosure of possible conflict of interest and as a consequence the protection of public policies towards these interests is one of the measures adopted for a better transparency in public life and to improve it. It particularly concerns possible conflict of interest with the tobacco lobby. These declarations are made public.

Some public stakeholders are also concerned by a control after their public activities, but this kind of control does not apply to some key stakeholders such as former collaborators of ministers particularly targeted by the tobacco lobby.

In 2020 and early 2021 the tobacco industry has been very active targeting MPs directly and indirectly through third party allies and lobbyists. They tried to pass amendments in favor of their activities, until now they failed but they use public health arguments to promote their activities. This becomes all the more necessary to enlarge the scope of obligations regarding disclosure of possible conflict of interest.

7. PREVENTIVE MEASURES

The government requires the tobacco industry to submit information on tobacco products, ingredients.

Some data about the tobacco industry activities should be publicly accessible. For example, sales at local level. Besides this some data could be also useful to be collected and disseminated such as marketing expenses and studies.

The government has put in place a policy to disallow the acceptance of all forms of contributions/ gifts from the tobacco industry (monetary or otherwise) including offers of assistance, policy drafts, or study visit invitations given or offered to the government, its agencies, officials, and their relatives.

The government has not particularly formulated, adopted or implemented a code of conduct for public officials, prescribing the standards with which they should comply in their dealings with the tobacco industry. Their rules concern any possible interest, but nothing is specific for the tobacco lobby. This lack of specific rules is problematic because public servants or other public authorities do not know the particularities of the tobacco industry's activities and they do not adopt special rules to protect their activities towards the tobacco industry and its allies.

Therefore, despite some progress and information disseminated by health ministry and the civil society acting in collaboration with this ministry, there is no systematic information disseminated to all the public stakeholders who may be in contact with the tobacco industry and its allies.

The FCTC treaty remains still little known by many stakeholders and particularly its provisions regarding the protection of public policies from the tobacco industry interests.

Recommendations

Different provisions could contribute to improve the protection of public policies in France regarding the interference of the tobacco industry and its allies. They particularly could consolidate and strengthen the legal framework to protect public policies against the interference of the tobacco industry.

- I. Increase awareness at each level of political decision-making about tobacco industry's interference on tobacco control policies as well as their strategy to use CSR, harm reduction to improve its image and participate in political decisions and legislations.
- 2. Define specific rules for public servants and collaborators in all departments of the government and in local political jurisdictions on how to deal with the tobacco industry on necessary situations. This protocol could be considered as code of conduct for public officials, prescribing the standards with which they should comply in their dealings with the tobacco industry.
 Disseminate these rules to MPs and include in current disclosures from MPs info regarding possible link with the tobacco industry.
- 3. Define a practical protocol explaining in detail how to react in case of interference of the tobacco industry such as the participation of a representative of the tobacco industry at a public event or at a private event gathering representatives from France.
- 4. Investigate current disclosure made by the tobacco industry regarding transparency rules about lobby expenses and evaluate its sincerity and possible circumventions and violations.
- 5. Prohibit interaction with third party allies and lobbyists of the tobacco industry.
- 6. Prohibit any public financial support to an organisation member that works or holds positions directly or indirectly with the tobacco industry.
- 7. Adopt an appropriate and holistic legal framework for tobacco control. This should include policies not limited to public health but also for environmental topics in order to fully capture the limitation of interaction with the tobacco industry. See adapt the current rules about the extended producer responsibility in order to include article 5.3 obligations in this legal framework especially in terms of no delegation of activities to the tobacco industry.

2021 Tobacco Industry Interference Index Results and Findings

		0		2	3	4	5
INDI	CATOR I: Level of Industry Participation in Policy-Deve	eloj	ome	ent			
I. Th	ne government ⁴ accepts, supports or endorses any offer for						
ass	sistance by or in collaboration with the tobacco industry ⁵ in				2		
se	tting or implementing public health policies in relation to				,		
to	bacco control ⁶ (Rec 3.1)						

France adopted different legislations in order to protect its general public policies from the vested interests of and interference from the tobacco industry. The government have imposed rules for transparency.

In 2020-2021, the tobacco control policy was defined and implemented without collaboration with the tobacco industry both at the national ⁷ and local level ⁸ ⁹. The strategy and rules remained unchanged and clear, prohibiting contribution from the tobacco industry in setting or implementing public health policies in relation to tobacco control.

Tobacco control policies are particularly discussed in the framework of a committee named "The Comité de Coordination du Plan national de lutte contre le tabac" gathering representatives from ministers, public agencies and also representatives from NGOs and the civil society.

Due to relationship between organizations specialized in e-cigarettes and the tobacco industry, the participation of the NGO AIDUCE (Association Indépendante Des Utilisateurs de Cigarettes Electroniques) involved in e-cigarettes and also a member of INNCO, (International Network of Nicotine Consumer Organisations) means this organization's presence in this Committee, has an indirect relationship with the tobacco industry. INNCO has a direct relationship with the Foundation for a Smoke-Free World (FSFW), a Philip Morris International (PMI)-funded front group. Knowledge Action Change, a recipient of FSFW funding, also had a key role in establishing INNCO as a lobbying organisation by framing its position on harm reduction¹⁰. This loophole needs to be examined and highlighted.

⁴ The term "government" refers to any public official whether or not acting within the scope of authority as long as cloaked with such authority or holding out to another as having such authority

⁵ The term, "tobacco industry' includes those representing its interests or working to further its interests, including the State-owned tobacco industry.

⁶ "Offer of assistance" may include draft legislation, technical input, recommendations, oversees study tour

⁷ https://solidarites-sante.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/180702-pnlt_def.pdf

⁸ https://solidarites-sante.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/aap_mobilisation_societe_civile_cdc_2019.pdf https://www.drogues.gouv.fr/actualites/lancement-de-lappel-projets-2020-favoriser-mobilisation-de-societe-civile-contre https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/download/pdf/circ?id=44985

⁹ https://www.grand-est.ars.sante.fr/fond-addictions-2020-appel-projets-region-grand-est

¹⁰ https://tobaccotactics.org/wiki/international-network-of-nicotine-consumer-organisations-innco/

No member of the French delegations was a representative from the tobacco industry. ¹⁵

parties/additional-documents/fctc-cop-7-div-1-list-of-participants
https://apps.who.int/gb/fctc/PDF/cop6/FCTC_COP6_DIV1Rev1.pdf

¹¹ La confédération a bien obtenu deux années de gel de fiscalité en 2021 et 2022, Le Monde du tabac, 25 mars 2021 https://www.lemondedutabac.com/revue-des-tabacs-la-confederation-a-bien-obtenu-deux-annees-de-gel-de-fiscalite-en-2021-et-2022-philippe-coy/

¹² Buralistes / Ile de France, signature d'une convention, Le Monde du tabac, 25 novembre 2020, https://www.lemondedutabac.com/buralistes-ile-de-france-signature-dune-convention-avec-la-region/.

 $https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCodeArticle.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006072665\&idArticle=LEGIARTI000022053005\\ \&dateTexte=\&categorieLien=cid$

¹⁴ Please annex a list since 2009 so that the respondent can quantify the frequency, http://www.who.int/fctc/cop/en/

¹⁵ https://www.who.int/fctc/cop/sessions/cop8/LOP_Final.pdf https://fctc.who.int/who-fctc/governance/conference-of-the-parties/seventh-session-of-the-conference-of-the-

	0	-	2	3	4	5
INDICATOR 2: Industry CSR activities						
5. A. The government agencies or its officials endorses, supports, forms partnerships with or participates in so-called CSR activities organized by the tobacco industry. (Rec 6.2)			2			
B. The government (its agencies and officials) receives contributions (monetary or otherwise) from the tobacco industry (including so-called CSR contributions). (Rec 6.4)						

The legal framework ¹⁷ has remained the same since the last report. Since 1991, there is a comprehensive advertising ban in France. However the text was strengthened only in 2016 with clear provisions regarding a ban for philanthropy activities including CSR.

The legislation says that any sponsorship or philanthropy action is prohibited when it is carried out by manufacturers, importers or distributors of tobacco products **or** when its purpose or effect is direct or indirect promotion in favor of tobacco, tobacco products and ingredients.

The scope of this legislation is very large: prohibition of CSR activities carried out by the tobacco industry, importers, distributors but also any CSR action carried out by a third party which could promote tobacco directly or indirectly. Moreover, the sanctions in case of violations are quite high and there is also a possibility for specialized NGO to launch legal actions in case of violations.

Notwithstanding, the tobacco industry was still able to conduct its CSR activities this year through the following loopholes in the legislation:

- As in previous reports this rule doesn't apply to the tobacco retailers and its federation which are still involved in CSR operations and communicate on such operations. ¹⁸ Therefore, the part played by the tobacco retailer continue to be

 $https://apps.who.int/gb/fctc/PDF/cop5/FCTC_COP5_DIV1_Rev1.pdf$

https://apps.who.int/gb/fctc/PDF/cop4/COP4 DIV Rev1.pdf

¹⁶ political, social financial, educations, community, technical expertise or training to counter smuggling or any other forms of contributions

 $^{^{17}}$ Code de la santé publique, Livre V Lutte contre le tabagisme,

 $https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/section_lc/LEGITEXT000006072665/LEGISCTA000006140619/2021-04-03/\#LEGISCTA000006140619$

¹⁸ Solidarité : Buralistes d'Eure et Loir : don de masques aux jeunes pompiers, le Monde du Tabac, 7 avril 2012 https://www.lemondedutabac.com/page/6/?s=covid

- very important and their image even has improved due to the COVID-19 pandemic. 19
- The European directive concerning the reduction of plastic led to include the tobacco industry in the discussion of provisions imposed to tobacco makers in the framework of the so called "extended producer responsibility". The tobacco industry used this opportunity to communicate to improve its image. ²⁰



Philip Morris invites itself to the Salon Produrable

6. The government accommodates requests from the tobacco industry for a longer time frame for implementation or postponement of tobacco control law. (e.g. 180 days is common for PHW, Tax increase can be implemented within 1 month)

No special new provision was implemented following national decision.

At the European level, despite pressure from the tobacco industry to Members States and the European Commission, no further postponement request regarding the enforcement

7. The government gives privileges, incentives, exemptions or benefits to the tobacco industry (Rec 7.3)

An important privilege mentioned in previous reports was significantly reduced. It concerns the quantity of tobacco products defined as a "personal and private consumption."

of the ban of menthol in cigarettes and roll your own tobacco was approved.

In the past when a French national arrives in France from a European Union country, he/she could bring in duty-free 800 cigarettes or 400 small cigars or 200 other cigars or I

(Rec 7.1)

¹⁹ La crise sanitaire a renforcé notre rôle d'utilité locale, ca a profondément redoré l'image Le Monde du tabac, 23 décembre 2020 : https://www.lemondedutabac.com/la-crise-sanitaire-a-renforce-notre-role-dutilite-locale-ca-a-profondement-redore-limage-marie-pierre-ferland-lot-et-garonne/

²⁰ Philip Morris s'invite au salon produrable, le 14 septembre 2020, https://www.generationsanstabac.org/actualites/philip-morris-produrable-rse/

kg raw tobacco to smoke. ²¹ Additionally, when foreigners enter France from a country outside the European Union, the quantity is more limited to 200 cigarettes **or** 100 small cigars or 50 other cigars or 250 g raw tobacco to smoke. The European Union and its Member States are parties to the FCTC and they should reduce this level.

Recently, the authorized allowed quantity is the same whatever the origin of the country may be. That means a person may import 200 cigarettes **or** 100 small cigars or 50 other cigars or 250 g raw tobacco to smoke into France. ²²

However, we also have in France a taxation which differs according to the products: new tobacco products such as heat not burn tobacco are much less taxed (about 70%) than traditional manufactured cigarettes and roll your own cigarettes (about 80%) of retail price.²³

Besides this, since 2004, the French government has developed contracts with the professional organization of tobacco retailers. The purpose was initially to support them to diversify their activities but according to evaluations carried out by an institution called the *Cour des comptes*, which supported the tobacco activities to the detriment of tobacco control policies ²⁴ and public money. ²⁵

Moreover, these different contracts include a clause for a possible new agreement at a date usually before elections where the tobacco retailers make pressure on policymakers and candidates²⁶.

The last contract adopted in 2018 is still effective. It was officially focused on the diversification of tobacco retailers regarding the objective of a non-smoking generation by 2032. ²⁷ ²⁸

Lastly, at the local level because provisions of Article 5.3 remain too often unknown, some vigilance remains essential to avoid the adoption of measures in support of the tobacco industry.²⁹

INDICATOR 4: Forms of Unnecessary Interaction

 $^{^{21}\,}https://europa.eu/youreurope/citizens/travel/carry/alcohol-tobacco-cash/index_fr.htm$

²² https://www.douane.gouv.fr/demarche/vous-rapportez-du-tabac-achete-dans-un-pays-de-lunion-europeenne

²³ https://www.douane.gouv.fr/fiche/la-fiscalite-appliquee-aux-tabacs-manufactures

²⁴ https://www.ccomptes.fr/sites/default/files/EzPublish/rapport evaluation lutte contre tabagisme.pdf

²⁵ https://www.ccomptes.fr/sites/default/files/EzPublish/08-lutte-contre-tabagisme-RPA2016-Tome-2.pdf

²⁶ https://www.lesechos.fr/2017/04/buraliste-la-profession-qui-murmure-a-loreille-des-politiques-164887

²⁷ http://www.douane.gouv.fr/articles/a14640-signature-du-protocole-d-accord-sur-la-transformation-du-reseau-des-buralistes

²⁸ http://www.douane.gouv.fr/Portals/0/fichiers/actualites/2018-02/163-pa.pdf

²⁹ https://subventions.fr/guide-des-aides/production-de-tabac/

		0	2	3	4	5
8.	Top level government officials (such as President/ Prime Minister					
	or Minister ³⁰) meet with/ foster relations with the tobacco					
	companies such as attending social functions and other events		2			
	sponsored or organized by the tobacco companies or those					
	furthering its interests. (Rec 2.1)					

In September 2020, a trade show was organised called "Salon pro-durable" about sustainable development with the support of two ministries: Ministry for the ecological transition, and Ministry for Territorial Cohesion and Relations with Local Government. Philip Morris was present at this event and even organized a session ^{31 32}.

9. The government accepts assistance/ offers of assistance from the tobacco industry on enforcement such as conducting raids on tobacco smuggling or enforcing smoke free policies or no sales to minors. (including monetary contribution for these activities) (Rec 4.3)

Like in the previous report, no information was found about such situation in 2019 and in 2020 but some activities may be unknown.

10. The government accepts, supports, endorses, or enters into partnerships or agreements with the tobacco industry. (Rec 3.1)

NOTE: This must not involve CSR, enforcement activity, or tobacco control policy development since these are already covered in the previous questions.

Comments mentioned in the previous report remain effective: agreements were negotiated some years ago both at the European level and the national level between public authorities (OLAF for UE – Customs for France) and the tobacco industry. The agreements concern the fight against illicit trade of tobacco products.

In 2016 France, as a member state, supported the position not to renegotiate the contract with Philip Morris. But other agreements are still going on with consequences for member states.

For example, France negotiated an agreement in 2012 with Imperial Tobacco ³³ and should focus its involvement in the implementation of the ITP, International Protocol to eliminate illicit trade in tobacco products, ratified in 2015.

³⁰ Includes immediate members of the families of the high-level officials

³¹ https://www.produrable.com/exposants?page=2#guests-list-206188

³² https://www.produrable.com/xposants/602a26882784893bb43652c8?back_page=2

³³ http://douane.gouv.fr/Portals/0/fichiers/information/publication-douane/bilans-resultats/rap-2012.pdf

Besides this, the current European system for tracking and tracing which entered into force in May 2019 does not comply with the FCTC treaty because some missions are delegated to the tobacco industry. France should ask in the process of the revision of the current European Tobacco Product Directive to include this topic in the future revision so that the tracking and tracing system be directly and indirectly independent from the tobacco industry and ask again to definitely stop contracts with the tobacco industry in that topic.

INDICATOR 5: Transparency

II. The government does not publicly disclose meetings/ interactions with the tobacco industry in cases where such interactions are strictly necessary for regulation. (Rec 2.2)

2

Provisions mentioned in the last report are currently the same. We have to distinguish the executive and the legislative level. Concerning the Ministers, there is a publication each week of their diary with information about meetings, including with the tobacco industry. However, this information would no longer be available with the new diary concerning the next week.

At the local level, we only have this information for key stakeholders. At the level of the Parliament, there is no obligation concerning this information. Some MPs have their own website on which they inform about their activities but it is not mandatory.

If there are hearings organized in the framework of the elaboration of a legislative text, the information is included in the text or if there are a debate on a topic. ³⁴

12. The government requires rules for the disclosure or registration of tobacco industry entities, affiliated organizations, and individuals acting on their behalf including lobbyists (Rec 5.3)

1

There are specific rules defined concerning the transparency of the tobacco industry activities in lobbying. According to the legislation published in January 2016, there is a special public disclosure of expenses related to influence or interest representation activities of manufacturers, importers and distributors of tobacco products and their representatives.³⁵ ³⁶

For the third year, manufacturers, importers and distributors of tobacco products, as well as businesses, professional organizations or associations representing them, reported to

 $https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCodeArticle.do; jsessionid=B9643F66EA3B878671ABC3460037E715.tpdila13v_3? idArticle=LEGIARTI000032548837\&cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006072665\&dateTexte=20200101$

³⁴ https://www2.assemblee-nationale.fr/15/commissions-permanentes/commission-des-finances/missions-d-information/consommation-de-tabac-et-du-rendement-de-sa-fiscalite-pendant-le-confinement

³⁵ See Code of public health

³⁶ Decree for enforcement :

 $https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCodeArticle.do; jsessionid=B9643F66EA3B878671ABC3460037E715.tpdila13v_3?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000006072665\&idArticle=LEGIARTI000034135783\&dateTexte=20170621\&categorieLien=cid\#LEGIARTI000034135783$

the Ministry of Solidarity and Health all expenditures related to activities influence or interest representation for the year 2017. ³⁷ ³⁸

- Are considered expenses related to influence or interest representation activities:
 - Remunerations of personnel employed full time or partly to exercise influence or interest representation activities;
 - Purchase of services from consulting companies in influencing or interest representation activities;
 - Benefits in kind or in cash, worth more than € 10, provided to:
 - . members of the Government;
 - . members of ministerial offices or collaborators of the President of the Republic;
 - . collaborators of the President of the National Assembly or the President of the Senate;
 - . parliamentarians;
 - . persons entrusted with a public service mission which their mission or the nature of their function calls for taking or preparing the decisions and opinions of the public authorities relating to tobacco products;
 - . experts, natural or legal persons, charged, by agreement with a public person, with an advisory mission on behalf of a public person whose mission is to take or prepare the decisions and opinions of the public authorities relating to the tobacco products.

These statements are available at the website of the health ministry and remain accessible for five years, as of their posting.

Reporting companies and entities are responsible for the accuracy of the published content.

In case of lack of report or mis-disclosure, sanctions are planned.

In the past years the publication of such disclosures generated press articles and also raised questions among citizens to their MPs. In the last report there was no particular media coverage following the publication of these reports because no specific invitation nor gift were mentioned.

³⁷ https://solidarites-sante.gouv.fr/prevention-en-sante/addictions/article/transparence-des-relations-d-influence-de-industrie-du-tabac

 $^{^{38}}$ https://solidarites-sante.gouv.fr/prevention-en-sante/addictions/article/transparence-des-relations-d-influence-de-industrie-du-tabac-chiffres-2018

INDICATOR 6: Conflict of Interest			
13. The government does not prohibit contributions from the			
tobacco industry or any entity working to further its interests to			
political parties, candidates, or campaigns or to require full	•		
disclosure of such contributions. (Rec 4.11)			

No change with the situation analysed in previous reports:

- Financial support for political parties as well as for political candidates or campaigns come from public money and from individual people but in this last case each people is allowed to give a limited amount of money (ex for a party at the highest 7 500 euros a year, for a candidate at the highest 4 600 euros and if the donation is more than 150 Euros, there are rules imposed for the payment).
- Gift, donations from firms are prohibited as well as from foreign countries, trade unions, other NGO except the party of the candidate.

There are also strict rules for loans: prohibited from firms ... and limited to maximum 5 years from individual people. ^{39 40 41}

14. Retired senior government officials form part of the tobacco				
industry (former Prime Minister, Minister, Attorney General)		2		
(Rec 4.4)				

No change with the previous report:

- The High Authority is also responsible for controlling the "pantouflage" of former ministers, former presidents of a local executive as well as former members of independent administrative or public authorities. The Authority checks if the professional reconversion is in the private sector at the end of their public functions or mandates.
- For a period of three years, anyone who has held one of these positions must submit a request to the High Authority to examine whether the new private activities that it plans to pursue are compatible with its former functions. Are concerned the liberal activities (for example the exercise of the profession of

³⁹ Loi n° 95-65 du 19 janvier 1995 relative au financement de la vie politique,

https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT000000186650&categorieLien=id

⁴⁰https://www.vie-publique.fr/actualite/dossier/moralisation/confiance-vie-politique-financement-partis-politiques.html

⁴¹ LOI n° 2017-1339 du 15 septembre 2017 pour la confiance dans la vie politique,

https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT000035567974&categorieLien=id

lawyer) or the private activities remunerated within a public or private enterprise (salaried activity, creation of a company, etc.) as well as those exerted within a public industrial and commercial establishment or within a public interest group of an industrial and commercial nature.

-

- The High Authority checks whether the new activity is problematic at a penal or deontological level. When it identifies such difficulties, it may issue a notice of incompatibility, which prevents the person from carrying out the envisaged activity or a notice of compatibility with limits, in which it imposes precautionary measures.
- However, this legislation only applies to some public authorities. ⁴² That is why we still have former public representatives who are involved directly or indirectly in the tobacco industry nowadays or former representatives of the tobacco industry who may still play a part in public institutions or public firms.

15. <u>Current government officials</u> and relatives hold positions in the			
·			
tobacco business including consultancy positions. (Rec 4.5, 4.8,	ı		
, , , , ,			
4.10)			

No change with the reports:

- Since the adoption of new legislations in 2013 ⁴³, in 2016 ⁴⁴ and 2017 about the transparency of the public life ⁴⁵ more rules for transparency are imposed to public authorities and to private stakeholders.
- The law aims to create more transparency in the process of public decision making and in economic life. There is a data base collecting information on the relations between the representatives of interests and the public authorities.
- These data are collected by an independent agency and publicly available. The High Authority manages a public register of lobbyists in order to provide information on key aspects of lobbying activities. Each stakeholder must declare, each year, the identity of the interest representative, the identity of individuals in charge of lobbying activities, the scope of lobbying activities, the lobbyist's membership in organizations, the identity of third parties on whose behalf lobbying activities are performed etc.
- The High Authority controls the integrity of the highest-ranking French public officials, who are required to disclose their assets and interests ⁴⁶.

The law establishes a list of public officials for whom a communication may constitute a lobbying activity. Until 30 June 2018, the list includes the following officials:

transparency-in-public-life.pdf

⁴² See people involved by these obligations: https://www.hatvp.fr/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/Tableau-Obligations-declaratives-RP-avril-2019.pdf

⁴³ https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT000028056315 https://www.hatvp.fr/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/Act-no.-2013-907-dated-11-October-2013-on-

https://www.hatvp.fr/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/Articles-LO-135-1-to-135-6.pdf

⁴⁴ https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT000033558528&categorieLien=id

⁴⁵ https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT000035567974&categorieLien=id

⁴⁶ https://www.hatvp.fr

- members of the government;
- members of ministerial cabinets and staff of the President of the Republic;
- MPs and their staff (National Assembly and Senate);
- the President of the National Assembly, the President of the Senate and their cabinet members (National Assembly and Senate);
- officials of the departments of the National Assembly and the Senate, whose list is published on the website of each chamber;
- members of the board and sanctions committees of the independent administrative and public authorities mentioned in Article 11 of the Law of 11 October 2013:
- the directors-general and secretaries-general of the aforesaid authorities, as well as their deputies;
- people with decision-making positions in the government, for which they were appointed in the Council of Ministers. The list of such positions will be published and updated regularly on the website of the High Authority.

As of 1st July 2018, a number of local executive officials and other public officials, such as certain heads of unit and deputy directors in central administrations, have been also included in the list.

- The parliamentary mandate is nowadays incompatible with certain functions, whether public or private. In order to prevent the risk of conflicts of interest, the incompatibilities related to consulting activities are reinforced and extended. They concern the personal exercise of a consulting activity but also the management functions of a consulting company and the holding of control of such a company. Therefore, a member of Parliament may no longer:
 - start a counselling activity that was not his before the beginning of his term, including a regulated profession such as a lawyer;
 - pursue a consulting activity started less than a year before the beginning of his term;
- provide consulting services to entities working primarily for public persons;
 acquire or retain control of a consulting firm if it acquired it less than one year before the beginning of its mandate.

INDICATOR 7: Preventive Measures 16. The government has put in place a procedure for disclosing the records of the interaction (such as agenda, attendees, minutes and outcome) with the tobacco industry and its representatives. (Rec 5.1)

As mentioned in previous reports there is a policy but it is only partial and not sufficient.

 $^{^{47}\,}https://www.vie-publique.fr/actualite/dossier/moralisation-vie-publique-lois-confiance-vie-politique/mesures-visant-prevention-conflits-interets.html$

https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT000035567974&categorieLien=id

- Information is published each week concerning the planning of ministers.

This information is however limited: it only concerns the name of the firm, representatives and the date of the meeting. But no information is available about the agenda and the outcome of this meeting.

- This information is available during a week until the publication for the new meeting is up.
- Other public authorities do not have such obligations to inform the general public about meeting with representatives of the tobacco industry.
- 17. The government has formulated, adopted or implemented a code of conduct for public officials, prescribing the standards with which they should comply in their dealings with the tobacco industry. (Rec 4.2)

3

No improvement has been recorded this reporting period, despite repeated recommendations.

- Except rules which apply to any civil servant and public officer with any administered, no specific rules or programs have been defined concerning their relationships with representatives of the tobacco industry. In this respect many of them even do not see the problem to adopt specific rules regarding the tobacco industry because there is a lack of information about this topic.
- At the level of the health ministry, if representatives from the tobacco industry ask for a meeting, for example in order to get information about a legislation, they received as any other administered. And in 2020 and early 2021 the relationship was limited to such dealing like the year before.

The Health Minister also disseminates such standards to agencies which may have relationship with the tobacco industry such as the ANSES, (Agence Nationale Sécurité Sanitaire Alimentaire), which collects data on ingredients from the tobacco makers.

There are rules which were enforced. The same rules mentioned in the previous report. However, these rules are not specific for the tobacco industry despite the fact that thanks to the FCTC treaty and article 5.3 public health authorities are more aware of their obligations. This awareness is not similar in other departments.

	0		2	3	4	15
18. The government requires the tobacco industry to periodically submit information on tobacco production, manufacture, market share, marketing expenditures, revenues and any other activity, including lobbying, philanthropy, political contributions and all other activities. (5.2)		-				

No change recorded from previous reports.

- The code of taxation imposes the tobacco industry to send the list of all of their references: for each kind of tobacco product, the brand, the commercial brand, the quantity, the present price and the price after promulgation. This list is the condition to get authorisation to sell the products in the French market. The purpose is to have a unique price in the whole country. The order was signed both by the Finance Minister and the Health Minister. ⁴⁸ It is therefore possible to know the price of any product sold on the French market and this information is in open data ⁴⁹.
- In France there is a monopoly on the sale of tobacco products by tobacco retailers. There is also the possibility for some restaurants or patrol station to sell a very limited amount of tobacco products if they have the authorisation⁵⁰. Except for cross border purchase for private consumption or duty free, any other way to buy or sell tobacco products is prohibited, including on the internet.

Each month on the basis of sales sold to tobacco retailers by distributors, the budget minister releases data about tobacco sales in the country. These data are publicized monthly for cigarettes, roll your on tobacco and other tobacco products on a public website ^{51.}

This public information is very useful because the tobacco industry regularly communicates fake news and thanks on consumption and sales and this official statistics can be opposed ⁵².

- Concerning market shares, there are no publicly available data but the professional magazine called "the Revue des tabacs au Coeur de la Ville" disseminates, each month, information about main brands reaching roughly 75% of the market.
- As far as marketing expenditures are concerned: there is a comprehensive advertising ban including at point of sale. However, there is still the possibility to have advertising in the professional press and support and no information are available about these expenditures. Besides this, tobacco retailers are supposed to be paid only on the basis of a percentage of the sale price. However, the tobacco

 $^{^{48}\,}https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT000039223599\& categorieLien=id.pdf.$

⁴⁹https://www.douane.gouv.fr/la-douane/opendata/categories/tabacs-manufactures

⁵⁰ https://www.douane.gouv.fr/demarche/devenir-revendeur-de-tabac

⁵¹ https://www.ofdt.fr/statistiques-et-infographie/tableau-de-bord-tabac/

 $^{^{52}}$ http://www.lemondedutabac.com/marche-du-tabac-une-augmentation-de-237-directement-liee-a-la-fermeture-desfrontieres-seita/

industry continues to give them incentives in order to promote the sale of their products. ⁵³

- Concerning expenses and activities for the lobbying there is a special register devoted to collect these data, each year with an open access via a website.
- There is no communication about philanthropy activities because such activities are prohibited.
- Some information like political contributions is prohibited, not only for the tobacco industry and there are monitoring of the budget for parties and political campaigns because they receive public financial support ⁵⁴.
- Other activities the Tobacco Products Directive which has been transposed in France ⁵⁵ imposes the tobacco industry to declare publish information on ingredients to a public agency, ANSES ⁵⁶.

This agency is collecting and analyzing the information contained in these declarations. For these products, which are not subject to marketing authorization, this expert appraisal mission aims to provide scientific and technical support to the competent authority. It is funded by fees paid by the organizations declaring the tobacco products and vaping products.

- 19. The government has a program / system/ plan to consistently⁵⁷
 raise awareness within its departments on policies relating to
 FCTC Article 5.3 Guidelines. (Rec 1.1, 1.2)
 - There is still a lack of information regarding article 5.3, its guidelines and how to enforce these recommendations.
 - Even the ethic officer at the Parliament (National Assembly) ignores the FCTC treaty and its obligations.
 - The FCTC remains therefore still unknown by too many public stakeholders including some health authorities at the local level. It is all the more worrying that the tobacco industry especially Philip Morris is particularly active in public relations either directly or indirectly.

⁵³ https://www.europe1.fr/economie/Petits-arrangements-entre-cigarettiers-et-buralistes-595484

⁵⁴ http://www.cnccfp.fr/

⁵⁵ https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/eli/ordonnance/2016/5/19/AFSP1610773R/jo/texte

https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/eli/arrete/2016/8/22/AFSP1622636A/jo/texte

⁵⁶ https://www.anses.fr/en/content/tobacco-and-related-products

⁵⁷ For purposes of this question, "consistently" means: a. Each time the FCTC is discussed, 5.3 is explained. AND b. Whenever the opportunity arises such when the tobacco industry intervention is discovered or reported.

	0	2	3	4	5
20. The government has put in place a policy to disallow the					
acceptance of all forms of contributions/ gifts from the tobacco					
industry (monetary or otherwise) including offers of assistance,		2			
policy drafts, or study visit invitations given or offered to the					
government, its agencies, officials and their relatives. (3.4)					

Civil servants and other government officials may not solicit gifts in the performance of their duties. They may not accept gifts which are likely to influence the impartiality with which they are obliged to discharge their public service function or constitute a reward or compensation for services performed as part of their duties. If a civil servant and other government official receives an inappropriate gift, they have a duty to inform a superior as soon as possible ⁵⁸.

Any offence committed by a civil servant and other government official in the performance of or in connection with the performance of their duties will result in them facing a disciplinary sanction, without prejudice, where necessary, to any penalties imposed by the law.

The tobacco control legislation includes a provision imposing the tobacco industry to publicly declare benefits in kind or in cash, worth more than € 10, provided to:

- members of the Government:
- members of ministerial offices or collaborators of the President of the Republic;
- collaborators of the President of the National Assembly or the President of the Senate;
- parliamentarians;
- persons entrusted with a public service mission which their mission or the nature of their function calls for taking or preparing the decisions and opinions of the public authorities relating to tobacco products;
- experts, natural or legal persons, charged, by agreement with a public person, with an advisory mission on behalf of a public person whose mission is to take or prepare the decisions and opinions of the public authorities relating to the tobacco products.

These statements are available at the website of the health ministry.

However, the tobacco retailers and their representatives continue to organise events and visits where they invite public authorities. As already mentioned, even the Budget Ministry may have relations with the tobacco retailers because of a special contract between the public authorities and this profession to be authorized to sell tobacco products, the relationship with any politicians and public authorities go much beyond this legal framework. The obligation for transparency does not apply to tobacco retailers and their representatives hence becomes a way to interfere in public policies.

⁵⁸ Art 432-11 Criminal code https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/id/LEGISCTA000006165366/ .

	0	1	2	3	4	5
TOTAL			3	3		

ANNEX A: SOURCES OF INFORMATION

I. TOBACCO INDUSTRY ACTIVITY

LOCAL TOBACCO COMPANIES

LOCAL TOBACCO COTTI ATTIES		
Top 5 Local Tobacco Company	Market Share and Brands	Source
Cigarettes		
Philip Morris, Jeanne Pollès	44,44%, Marlboro, Philip	Revue des
https://www.pmi.com/markets/france/fr/	Morris, Chesterfield, L&M	Tabacs, n° 694,
		mars 2021
JTI France, Didier Elena	21,58%, Winston, Camel,	Revue des
https://www.jti.com/europe/france	Benson&Hedges	Tabacs, n° 694,
		mars 2021
Imperial Brands SEITA, Dior Decupper	16,55%, News, Gauloises	Revue des
https://www.seita.fr/	blondes and Brunes, JPS,	Tabacs, n° 694,
	Gitanes, Royale	mars 2021
BAT France, Pierre Durinck	15,31%, Lucky Strike,	Revue des
http://www.batfrance.com/	Winfield, Peter Stuyvesant,	Tabacs, n° 694,
	Vogue, Dunhill	mars 2021
Landewyck, Ludovic FROISSARD	0,87% Che	Revue des
http://www.hvl.lu/fr/lentreprise/emplace		Tabacs, n° 694,
ments/landewyck-france/		mars 2021

Top 5 Tobacco Company	Market Share and Brands	Source
Roll your own tobacco		
JTI France, Didier Elena	42,55%, Camel,	Revue des Tabacs,
https://www.jti.com/europe/france	Winston, Fleur du pays, Rasta	n° 694, mars 2021
Imperial Brands SEITA, Dior Decupper	18,49%, News,	Revue des Tabacs,
https://www.seita.fr/	Drum, Gauloises à rouler, JPS, Golden Virginia	n° 694, mars 2021
Philip Morris, Jeanne Pollès	17,59%, Interval,	Revue des Tabacs,
https://www.pmi.com/markets/france/fr/	Marlboro, Philip	n° 694, mars 2021
	Morris, L&M	
BAT France, Pierre Durinck	8,23%, Pall Mall,	Revue des Tabacs,
http://www.batfrance.com/	Lucky Strike, Ajja 17	n° 694, mars 2021
Traditab, Jérôme Duffieux	5,35% - 1637	Revue des Tabacs,
http://traditab.com/notre-aventure/		n° 694, mars 2021

TOBACCO FRONT GROUPS

Top 5 Tobacco	Type (Front Group/	Source
Industry	Affiliate/ Individual)	
Representative		

Confédération des Buralistes de France	Tobacco retailors organization	http://www.buralistes.fr/ https://cnct.fr/la-strategie-de-la- confederation-des-buralistes/
Lemondedutabac.com	Website affiliated to the tobacco retailors organisation	http://www.lemondedutabac.com/
Institut de Recherches Economiques et fiscales	Think tank	https://fr.irefeurope.org/
CNAC	Affiliate	http://www.blogpresidentcnac.fr/le- cnac/membres-du-cnac/
Nous sommes 13 millions	Website affiliated to the tobacco retailors organisation	https://www.nous-sommes-13- millions.com

a. News Sources

Top 5	Туре	Source : https://www.acpm.fr/L-
Newspaper/Dailies*	(Print/Online)	ACPM/Missions-et-activites
Le Monde	Print daily	https://www.lemonde.fr/
Le Figaro	Print daily	http://www.lefigaro.fr/
Les Echos	Print daily	https://www.lesechos.fr/
La Croix	Print daily	https://www.la-croix.com/
Aujourd'hui en France –	Print daily	http://www.aujourdhui-en-france.fr/
Le parisien		

*Basis of Ranking:	x Circulation	O Popularity O Others:	_
Ranking Authority	/ies:		

b. Government Agencies (Refer also to Annex A)

Agency	Specify if more than one	General Sources of Information/
	office is involved in this	News for each office
	function:	
I. Office of the Chief	Prime Minister : Edouard	https://www.gouvernement.fr/
Executive (Prime	Philippe 01/01/2020 –	
Minister/ President)	02/07/2020	
Members of Royalty	Jean Castex: 03/07/2020	
	President : Emmanuel	https://www.elysee.fr/
	Macron	,
2. Cabinet and/or	President National	http://www.assemblee-nationale.fr/
National Assembly (Policy	Assembly: Richard	·
makers)	Ferrand	https://www.senat.fr
,	President Senate:	·
	Gérard Larcher	
3. Agriculture / National	Didier Guillaume until	https://agriculture.gouv.fr
Tobacco Board	03/07/2020 and then	
	Julien Denormandie	

4. Customs	Gérald Darmanin	http://www.douane.gouv.fr/
5. Education	Jean Michel Blanquer	https://www.education.gouv.fr
6. Environment	François de Rugy until 03/07/2020 and then Barbara Pompili	https://www.ecologique- solidaire.gouv.fr
7. Finance/ Revenue/ Investments/ Excise	Bruno Le Maire	https://www.economie.gouv.fr/
8. Health	Agnès Buzyn until 17/02/2020 and then Olivier Véran	https://solidarites-sante.gouv.fr/
9. Labor	Muriel Pénicaud until 03/07/2020 and then Elisabeth Borne	https://travail- emploi.gouv.fr/ministere/la- ministre/
10. Trade and Industry/ Investments	See Bruno Le Maire in charge of Economy and Finance including trade / Industry	https://www.economie.gouv.fr/
Additional agencies/sectors to be named per country:		
11. Culture	Franck Riester until 03/07/2020 and then Roselyne Bachelot	http://www.culture.gouv.fr/
12. Higher education, research & innovation	Frédérique Vidal	http://www.enseignementsup- recherche.gouv.fr/
13.Europe & Foreign office	Jean-Yves Le Drian	https://www.diplomatie.gouv.fr/fr/
14.Sports	Roxana Maracineanu	http://www.sports.gouv.fr/
15.Interior	Christophe Castaner until 03/07/2020 and then Gerald Darmanin	https://www.interieur.gouv.fr/

c. Meetings Attended/ Public Hearings

Type of Meeting	Source
Commission for social matters including health at the National Assembly	http://www2.assemblee- nationale.fr/15/commissions- permanentes/commission-des-affaires- sociales/liens-commission-des-affaires- sociales/presentation Contact: Presidente Mme Fadila Khattabi fadila.khattabi@assemblee- nationale.fr Report: Thomas Mesnier Thomas.mesnier@assemblee- nationale.fr

Commission for social matters including	http://www.senat.fr/commission/soc
health at the Senate	Contact : Catherine Deroche
	c.deroche@senat.fr
	Report : Jean-Marie Vanlerenberghe
	jm.vanlerenberghe@senat.fr
Comité de pilotage du programme national	https://solidarites-
de réduction du tabagisme – Steering	sante.gouv.fr/IMG/pdf/180702-
committee for National Tobacco Control	pnlt_def.pdf
Programm	Contact = DGS : Chief of the Health
	Department, Pr Jérôme Salamon
Comité de coordination du programme	Idem
national de réduction du tabagisme /	
Comittee for coordination for national	
Tobacco control programm	

II. Laws. Policies, and issuances:

HEALTH LAWS:

I. Is there a health law database? If yes, please list which one will be used and cite the limitations:

Code for Public Health:

https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/texte_lc/LEGITEXT00000607266 5/

See legislative part : Troisième partie : Lutte contre les maladies et dépendances Livre V : Lutte contre le tabagisme et lutte contre le dopage Titre ler : Lutte contre le Tabagisme = from Article L3511-1 to Article L3512-28 + Articles 3515-1 to Article L3515-7

Regulatory Part: From Articles R 3511-1 to R 3515-8

2. Does the above sources include issuances? X Yes

ALL LAWS:

3. Is there a centralized (all) law database? If yes, please list which one will be used and cite the limitations:

Legifrance: https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/

https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichCode.do?cidTexte=LEGITEXT000 006072665&dateTexte=20190409 see Code for Public Health

4. Does the above sources include issuances? x Yes